



ASSESSMENT OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT EMPLOYEES PERFORMANCE IN EKITI STATE 2020 - 2023

¹DAHUNSI Elizabeth Abiola & ²ANIOBI Chiomeriwo Sunday

^{1&2}Department of Public Administration, Faculty of Management Sciences, Federal University Oye-Ekiti

ABSTRACT

The objective of this study is to access on Assessment of Local Government Employees performance in Ekiti State. The researcher used questionnaires as the instrument for the data collection. Descriptive survey research design was adopted for this study. A total of 150 respondents made Directors, Administrative staff, senior staff and junior staff were used for the study. The data collected were presented in tables and analyzed using simple percentages and frequencies. The findings reveals that compensation, supervision, training and development programmes, promotion, the workplace environment and salary payment on time influences employees' performance appraisal in Ekiti State. In conclusion, it was discovered that there are a number of challenges that affect performance appraisal, including lack of commitment among Local Government employees, lack of motivation and low pay, some employees who are unaware of their responsibilities, and insufficient resources. Other issues expressed include dissatisfaction with low salary and bad living circumstances, lack of consistency in the announcement of the execution of the government circular and working conditions, and inadequately provided allowances. Other issues discovered were lack of vision in the Local Government and insufficient resources. The study therefore recommends that government both at state and federal levels and as well as management of local government should be proactive through adequate budgetary provision, coupled with stable policy formulation and adoption of effective industrial resolution strategies that would favour the local government employees across the globe.

INTRODUCTION

Various studies, including Violeth (2015), Adellah (2014), and Kim (2014) have revealed that there are differences in ways public sector address challenges of poor performance and, thus, have different degrees of performance. For example, it is obvious that the performance of public organizations is different from that of the private ones.

Even though there are these differences, Armstrong and Murlis (2007) have pointed out that reward system has been used as a chief means of reinforcing performance in an organization. Another significant mechanism to promote employees' performance is communication. Managers and leaders of organizations can send a message to employees about what they consider important. In agreement with the aforesaid assertion, Kasser (2012) argued that a great deal of the way people behave in an organization is influenced by the way they are measured and rewarded.

Since time immemorial, the aim of many organizations has been to achieve the desired organizational goals. This is possible through organizing the reward systems in line with the organizational strategies (Allen and Helms, 2012). There is threat of hampering work performance if the reward system is not carefully observed. Under-management is a factor hampering organizational performance (Bruce, 2004). When the supervisor is not well engaged in management, the employees suffer the consequences and, thus, their performance is affected. It is this factor that Gupta (2010) called cohesion, meaning that there must be a close connection between the management and the subordinates. The employees operating in an environment with good cohesion is likely to dedicate efforts towards realizing the expected performance levels. Performance appraisal plays an important role in improving the performance of employees. It is also through performance appraisal that the employees' weakness can be noted and, thus, organize training to address the gap (Acton and Golden, 2012; Karia and Ahmad, 2010; Karia, 2009). Stone (2012) further emphasizes the importance of training to achieve the goals and interests of organizations.

The area of work is also another important area that may occasion poor performance of an employee. This is significant to employees' performance since the work environment is a set of interrelationships



that exist in the work area (Kohun, 2012). In the employees' work environment, there are key factors that have a great impact on the level of motivation and performance. Along with motivation, workers need the ability and skills to perform their work effectively (Chandrasekar, 2011). The best performance output could be well dictated by the existing work environment. This is because work environment directly impacts the performance of employees regardless of the nature of the organization (Martin, 2015).

All are agreed that local government is the government that is the closet to the grassroots and makes the highest impact on them. Poor condition of service has become a major issue in local government and this has affected the production capacity of the organization. Staff benefits such as; leave bonus, salaries, training allowances etc. are being withheld. Even the working environment of staff are not conducive, working equipment are not provided, promotion is delayed above all the motivation level is low.

The resultant effect of the poor condition of service will no doubt bring about lower performance of employees which in turn result to low productivity as stressed will begin to set in laziness, absenteeism, negligence, late coming, dishonesty and even disloyalty and other shoddy attitude. For instant, in most local government of Ekiti State is a case study in the research work are paying 30% for staff for the past a year now, all these will not allow the staff to put life, strength in whatever they are doing.

It is in the cause of this that the researcher deem it fit to choose this topic because of its importance to the employer and the employee and to come out with a lasting solution to tackle the issue of poor performance among local government employees in Ekiti State.

Statement of the Problem

The knowledge about employees' performance in organizational setting is of paramount importance to the Local Government Authorities. It is obvious that these factors are getting difficult and challenging due to the competitive nature of the corporate environment. There are a number of initiatives that are put in place so to improve employees' performance in Local Government Affairs (Mohammed, 2022). These are like the Local Government Reforms Programme (LGRP) and Structural Adjustment Programmes (SAP). These initiatives were suggested to transfer both financial resources and duties to the local government authorities to minimize the overloaded task of the central government. Unfortunately, the transfer could not be achieved due to poor grassroots employees' performances.

Some scholars have explicitly highlighted of the factors that led to the failure of implementation of the aforementioned initiatives (Kopoka, 2010; Shauri, 2001). The factors frequently mentioned are the inadequate transfer of power from the Central Government to the local government, frequent change of Local Government Officials, failure of servants and district councils' managers to be accountable to the ministries (Kopoka, 2010). Furthermore, a study by Mohammed (2022) identified other factors to include the lack of commitment in decentralization and devolution, lack of vision, inadequate capacity in financial services, as well as disproportion of financial resources. However, the literature has remained silent about the employees' poor performance among Ekiti State Local Government staff and the factors that may affect the performance of the employees. Research on the factors that affect poor employees' performance is significant given the fact that many organizations get unexpected outputs due to employees' underperformance. This is happening while it is only a small percent of the jobs in the Local Government are basically on contract and more than 80% are on a permanent basis. Therefore, this study is apt hoping that the findings of the study will give a vision of the strategies that the LGAs can adopt to improve performance of local government employees in Ekiti State.

Research Objectives

- i. identify factors which enhance employees' performance appraisal of local government employees in Ekiti State;
- ii. discover causes of employees' performance appraisal in Ekiti State local government;

Research Questions

- i. What are factors which enhance employees' performance among local government employees in Ekiti State?
- ii. What are the causes of employees' poor performance in Ekiti state local government?

Study Hypothesis

This will be guided by the following hypothesis:



- i. Good working condition and staff welfare tends to enhance employees performance in Ekiti State local government;
- ii. Poor performance among local government employees tends to slow down development in Ekiti State;

Conceptualizing Employees' Performance

Employee performance, according to Suhartini (2015), is a joint outcome of their efforts, talents, and perceptions of their work. This researcher emphasizes that there will be no successes if individuals in the organization do not perform well. As a result, greater efforts are required to achieve organizational goals. People's sentiments, organizational atmosphere, and performance are all linked by Freeman (2010). They do, however, point out that various organizations have different elements that distinguish one from another.

In the view of some research, employee satisfaction is related to work performance. Scholars who hold this viewpoint argue that happy employees help firms avoid large turnover costs (Aranoff et al., 2010). An enthusiastic employee is more likely to stay with the business and adds to great productivity. These experts argue that increasing the emphasis on authority, discipline, and control in organizations will not improve employee performance (Hart & Willower, 2014). Employees' performance is improved by skill development as a result of the training they get (Harel & Tzafrir, 2009). McEvoy (2013) highlights the need of training to increase dedication, information sharing, and organizational honor. Burke and Day (2016) discovered that educating managers can improve their effectiveness in the workplace. Companies should not be afraid of educating their staff since training them means investing in them for the benefit of the company. Employee morale improves when they are subjected to training (Bartel, 2014). When organizational justice is practiced in its real sense, it may have an impact on employee performance. The amount of commitment in an organization influences the level of achievement of their goals (Folger & Cropanzano, 2014).

Organizations utilize rewards as one of their methods to recruit and retain employees. Various human resource management methods have been highlighted in the literature as the best practices for maintaining and motivating human capital in organizations. Human resources, according to Khan (2011), are the drivers of an organization's success. As a result, organizations must offer a competitive compensation, reward employees, and satisfy their needs and expectations.

Good leadership motivates people by directing and encouraging them to attain certain outcomes and goals (Edy Sutrisno, 2010). According to Voon et al. (2011), leadership is defined as interactions between leaders and workers to influence employee behaviour toward the achievement of organizational goals. Based on the leadership indicators provided in this study, the leader should be able to:

- (1) inspire,
- (2) make decisions, and
- (3) be accountable.

Employees build multidimensional constructs to attain the goals set by good leaders. Leaders' success is judged by their ability to achieve their objectives (Mwita, 2010). As a result, managers are expected to make the most use of their talents, which may be developed under or without supervision. However, there are several demands placed on managers who work for a company.

However, it is highlighted that training must be methodical and result-oriented, establishing in trainees the knowledge and skill required to do job successfully (Gordon, 2012). This is achievable because training provides or improves employees' knowledge, skills, abilities, competences, and behaviour (April, 2010). Good organizations that are committed to profit are committed to educating their employees (Evans and Lindsay, 2009). The more driven a student, the faster and more methodically a new skill or information is learnt. Training should also be linked to money, career advancement, and recognition, among other things; in other words, something that the learner desires (Flippo, 2011).

Motivation is the most important prerequisite for training. Motivation is followed by the cue. With the use of training, a learner may detect the associated signs (cue) and correlate them with the intended responses in the cue. The response comes in third place. It is found in this that teaching should be promptly followed by positive reinforcement in order for a learner to react. Finally, feedback is the



information that a learner gets and reflects in the quality of his answer. To guarantee successful learning, it should be supplied as soon as feasible (Leslie, 2010).

Cooke (2010) states that efficiency and effectiveness drive performance and help an organization thrive in a competitive setting. According to the literature, the degree of performance cannot be universal, but each organization assesses performance based on the criteria set to meet the organization's goals. According to Kenney et al. (2012), an employee's performance is measured against the performance criteria established by the business. Employee performance is defined as how successfully they do their allocated job. Employees in any firm have certain expectations in terms of their performance.

Work conditions are defined by the business lexicon as "the work environment and all existing circumstances affecting labor in the workplace." Job hours, physical elements, legal, rights and responsibilities, corporate culture, work load, and training are among them. Because the environment is man-made, it must be preserved and enhanced by man, particularly via excellent management. As a result, the workplace is the setting in which a person accomplishes the responsibilities allocated to him or her (Chapins, 2015), whereas an effective workplace permits good results as desired by management (Mike, 2010; Shikdar, 2012).

Theoretical Review

This research work will be based on the ideas of Douglas Mc Grego theory X and Y. There are individual difference in terms of physical, morally and physiologically behaviour. Human beings have differences in perceptions norms and value in their characteristics pattern of their behaviour. These differences that exist in human beings lead us to the issue of behaviors and discipline. Some people are disciplined due to proper home training, education, interaction with others of identical discipline minds, and so on. There are yet others who are natural indolent, they dislike work and they have to be coerced or punish before they work. While others regards work as play or rest and need not to be coerced before they work.

Theory x, managers are more vulnerable to habitual institution of disciplinary proceedings against their workers after such activities or behaviour that could only require counseling. Where this persists, discipline itself tends to lose its tests of objectivity and productivity at the expense of that workers and management alike. It should be noted that Douglas Mc Grego (Theory Y) and Professor Rensis Likert submission that successful managers are those who shun the scientific management approach in favor of human relationship and behaviouricism style of course to the adherent of the scientific management. These does not make sense, for the average workers is naturally lazy and must be handled by the use of the stick approach, managers disciple and disciplinary proceedings became other of the day. However, in country that British system of administration has been established, the institution of the civil service commission has been created with the hope that it will make the public service non-political, impartial and efficient.

METHODOLOGY

Research Design

This section describes the strategy and actions utilized to arrive at the study's conclusions, as emphasized by Kothari (2012). A case study approach was essential in this study to gather sufficient and accurate data on people, events, or circumstances related to the study's issue (Robson, 2012 in Saunders et al., 2004). The case study approach assisted the researcher in this study in avoiding bias while maximizing dependability while keeping the research study's economic completion in mind. Furthermore, the design aided the researcher in gathering thorough information through the use of several data collection methods for an extended length of time (Creswell, 2009). Tellis (2013) stresses the use of case studies to obtain thorough data from respondents' perspectives.

RESULTS AND FINDINGS

Table 4.3: Factors which may Enhance Employees' Performance in (n = 82)

Factors	Frequency	Percentage (%)
Timely Payment of Salaries		
Strongly disagreed	18.0	22.0
Disagreed	4.0	4.9



Neutral	13.0	15.9
Agreed	31.0	37.8
Strongly Agreed	16.0	19.5
Total	82	100.0
Fair Employment Packages		
Strongly disagreed	14	17.1
Disagreed	18	22.0
Neutral	16	19.5
Agreed	20	24.4
Strongly Agreed	14	17.1
Total	82	100.0
Well Paid Allowances		
Strongly disagreed	29	35.4
Disagreed	19	23.2
Neutral	15	18.3
Agreed	9	11.0
Strongly Agreed	10	12.2
Total	82	100.0

Source: Field Data (2023)

Well-paid allowances were also one of the payment criteria that influenced employee performance. To get to the bottom of this, respondents were asked for their thoughts on the matter, and 29(35.4%) strongly disagreed, while 19(23.2%) disagreed. In contrast, 15(18.3%) were indifferent, and 10(12.2%) strongly agreed. The remaining 9 responses (11.0%) just agreed. The statistics above merely show that more than half of respondents believe allowances provided in the firm do not enhance employee performance, implying that allowances paid do not improve employee performance.

Table 4.4: Supervisor's Factors (n = 82)

Supervisor's Factors	Statistics	
	Frequency	Percentage (%)
Competent Supervisors		
Strongly Agreed	42	51.2
Agreed	30	36.6
Disagreed	10	12.2
Total	82	100.0
Supportive supervision		
Strongly Agreed	40	48.8
Agreed	22	26.8
Disagreed	20	24.4
Total	82	100.0
Work Delegation		
Agreed	62	75.6
Disagreed	20	24.4
Total	82	100.0

Source: Field Data (2023).

Supervision

The study's findings on supportive supervision revealed that 40(48.8%) of respondents believed that helpful supervision is a positive attribute for supervisors, and 42(51.2%) strongly agreed. Refer to Table 4. According to the survey findings, all respondents believe that supportive supervision is critical to obtaining and improving employee performance. The study's findings on work delegation revealed that 62(75.6%) of respondents agreed with the statement that delegation of work to team members may boost performance, while 20(24.4%) disagreed. Refer to Table 4.4 According to the survey findings,



all respondents believe that the problem of job delegation among employees is critical in obtaining and improving employee performance.

Table 4.5: Training and Development Programmes (n = 82)

Employee Career and Development Programmes	Frequency	Percentage (%)
Strongly Agreed	40	48.8
Agreed	32	39.0
Disagreed	10	12.2
Total	82	100.0
Annual Employee Training Plan		
Strongly Agreed	42	51.2
Agreed	40	48.8
Total	82	100.0

Source: Field Data (2023)

The third consideration was training and development programs. This investigation was expanded to see whether training and development programs have an effect on employee performance. A number of variables were explored in this respect, including the employee career and development programs given by the organization and whether the organization has an annual employee training plan.

Table 4.6: Promotion Factors (n = 82)

Promotion Factors	Responses	Frequencies	Percentages (%)
Promotion depends on skills	Strongly agreed	60	73.2
	Agreed	22	26.8
	Total	82	100.0
Compensations Policy	Strongly agreed	62	75.6
	Agreed	20	24.4
	Total	82	100.0
Overtime Duties	Strongly agreed	50	61.0
	Agreed	32	39.0
	Total	82	100.0

Source: Field Data (2023)

Promotion Factors

The respondents were asked whether their prospects of advancement are affected by their level of abilities and experience, and whether this would assist to enhance employee performance. Table 4.6 shows the specifics of their replies. Out of the 82 anticipated responders, 60(73.2%) strongly agreed that promotion had an influence on employee performance. 22(26.8%) responders, on the other hand, just agreed. According to the study's findings, all respondents believed that promotion is one of the variables that contribute to improve employee performance.

Table 4.7: Working Environment (n = 82)

Items	Responses	Frequencies	Percentages (%)
Closed Floor Plan Office	Strongly agreed	50	61.0
	Agreed	32	39.0
	Total	82	100.0
Lighting	Strongly agreed	42	51.2
	Agreed	30	36.6
	Disagreed	10	12.2
	Total	82	100.0
Noises	Strongly agreed	40	48.8
	Agreed	22	26.8
	Disagreed	20	24.4
	Total	82	100.0
Ventilation	Agreed	62	75.6
	Disagreed	20	24.4



	Total	82	100.0
Open Space	Strongly agreed	60	73.2
	Agreed	22	26.8
	Total	82	100.0
Overall Factors	Strongly agreed	62	75.6
	Agreed	20	24.4
	Total	82	100.0

Source: Field Data (2023)

The respondents were asked to express their thoughts on workplace variables that might affect employee performance. A number of attributes were detected, and the replies to each attribute are shown in table 4.7.

According to the findings, all of the respondents in the research see all of the aforementioned variables as crucial aspects to consider when increasing employee performance.

Findings

This chapter presents the key findings of the study in brief, relating them to the variables affecting employee performance appraisal of Local Governments in Ekiti State which were summarized below:

- Lack of commitment amongst employees at local government areas as a result of lack of dedication, lack of desire and poor income among the local government employees because some of the employees were unaware of their obligations.
- Lack of commitment is due to insufficient finances, dissatisfaction of low salary and terrible living conditions at the same time due to inconsistency in the notification on the execution of the government circular.
- Findings shows that there is a lack of vision at local government which affects employees' performance as a result of inadequate resources and time, the unclear vision and mission are not worked on, at the same time, there is a lot of incorrect information.
- The Federal Government controls everything and that political interference also contributes to the lack of vision.
- Inadequate capacity in financial resources findings shows that there is insufficient capacity in financial resources, which affect local government performance in Ekiti State.

REFERENCES

- Abdulla (2009). *Strategic HRM and Organizational Behaviour: Integrating Multiple Levels of Analysis*. Centre for Advanced Human Resources Studies Working Paper No. 007003 New York Cornell University.
- Acton, G, and Golden, J.S (2012). "Mood and Emotions while Working: Missing Pieces of Job Satisfaction." *Journal of Organizational Behavior* vol.No.21, Pp.185-202
- Adellah, Y.T. (2014). *Encouraging the Heart: A Leader's Guide to Rewarding and Recognizing Others*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Allen, R.R and Helms, I.I (2012). *Encouraging the Heart: A Leader's Guide to Rewarding and Recognizing Others*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- April, R. (2010). Inequity in Social Exchange. *Advances in Experimental Social Psychology*, 2: 267-299.
- Armstrong, M. (2006). *A Handbook of Human Resource Management Practice*, London, UK: Kogan Page, Ltd.
- Aranoff, A. (2010). *International Journal of Police Science & Management*; Vol. 6 Issue 1, p1-15.
- Attwood, S. (2006). Relationship Between Capacity Building and Employee Productivity on Performance of Commercial Banks in Kenya, *African Journal of History and Culture* Vol. 2(5), Pp 73-78.
- Babbie, C. (1992). *The Practice of Social Research*, 6th Ed., and London: Wadsworth Publishers.
- Bartel, K.U. (2014). The Mediating Effect of HRM Outcomes (Employee Retention) on the Relationship between HRM Practices and Organizational Performance, *International Journal of Human Resources Studies* Vol. 2 No. 1.
- Best, B. (2014). Psychological Contract and Employee Relationship; *The Icfai University Journal of Organization and Behaviour* Vol. 7 No. 4.



- Blyth, H.J (2008). HRM Practices, Organizational Citizenship Behaviour, and Performance: A Multilevel Analysis, *Journal of Management Studies* 47:7, and Blackwell Publishing Ltd.
- Bruce, A.(2013). How to Motivate Every Employee: 24 Proven Tactics to Spark Productivity in the Workplace. New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Chandrasekar H.H, (2011). Training is Changing Call Centre Perception. *Training Journal*, Vol.13 No.4, Pp. 18-21.
- Chapins, F. (2015). Predictors of Abusive Supervision: Supervisor Perceptions of Deep-Level Dissimilarity, Relationship Conflict and Subordinate Performance, *Academy of Management Journal* Vol. 54 No. 2, 279- 294.
- Chapins, H.H. (2015). The Full-Range of Leadership Development. Binghamton, NY: Center for Leadership Studies.
- Charles, L. (1995). Coverage, Sample Design, and Weighting in Three Federal Surveys" in *Journal of Drug Issues*, October 2001.
- Cohen, D. And Yokr, L. (2000). Research Method in Education, New York, Routledge.
- Choudry, R.T (2009). *Organizational Learning and the Earning Organization*, Sage, London.
- Creswell, Z. (2009). Deconstructing Job Satisfaction: Separating Evaluations, Beliefs and Affective Experiences." *Human Resource Management Review*, Vol. No. 12, Pp. 173-194.
- Cooke, W. (2000). Research Method in Education, New York, Routledge
- Denscombe, E. (1998). The Good Research Guide. Buckingham, Open University Press.
- Edy, S, (2010). Issues and Options for Improving Engagement between the World Bank and Civil Society Organizations, Washington D.C; USA.
- Evans, A and Lindsay, S (2009). Strategic HRM and Organizational Behaviour: Integrating Multiple Levels of Analysis. Centre for Advanced Human Resources Studies Working Paper No. 007003 New York Cornell University.
- Flippo, P. (2011). Performance in Organizations: Determinants and Appraisal. Glenview: Scott Foreman and Company.
- Folger, H. & Cropanzano, F. (2014). Linking Human Resources to Organizational Performance and Employee Relations in Human Service Organizations: Ten HR Essentials for Managers, Routledge London UK.
- Folger, M. & Cropanzano, J. (2014). Incentives for Managers and Inequality among Workers: Evidence from a Firm Level Experiment. *Quarterly Journal of Economics* 122, 729 773.
- Folger, M. & Cropanzano, J. (2014). Incentives for Managers and Inequality among Workers: Evidence from a Firm Level Experiment. *Quarterly Journal of Economics* 122, 729 773.
- Gupta, H.(2010). *How to Motivate Every Employee: 24 Proven Tactics to Spark Productivity in the Workplace*. New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Harel, J. & Tzafrir, G. (2009). Merit Pay, Performance Appraisal, and Individual Motivation: an Analysis and Alternative. *Human Resource Management*, 37:131-146.
- Karia, A. A (2009). *Encouraging the Heart: A Leader's Guide to Rewarding and Recognizing Others*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Kasser, T. (2012). Training is Changing Call Centre Perception. *Training Journal*, Vol.13 No.4, pp. 18-21.
- Kenney, U. (2012) *Organizational Learning and the Earning Organization*, Sage, London.
- Khan, N.N (2011). *Organization Theory: Modern, Symbolic, and Postmodern Perspective*. Oxford University Press, Oxford.
- Kim, H.K (2014). Work-life Balance and Performance: The Meditating Role of Affective Commitment. *Global Business and Management Research: an International Journal*, 6 (37-51).
- Kohun, E. A (2012). Human Resource Management, Concepts and Issues, 2nd Revised Ed., Delhi: Dhanpat Ray& Co. (P) Ltd. *View of Economic Studies* 71, 514-534.
- Kopoka, B.C (2010). *Performance in Organizations: Determinants and Appraisal*. Glenview: Scott Foreman and Company.
- Kothari, K. S. (2012). *The SAGE Handbook of Qualitative Research*. Sage Publications Inc, UK.
- Martin, S.E (2015). *Human Resource Management* (6th ed.). New York: John Wiley and Sons, Inc.
- McEvoy (2013). Work-life Balance and Performance: The Meditating Role of Affective Commitment. *Global Business and Management Research: an International Journal*, 6(37-51).



- Mike, M.K. (2010). "Effects of Reengineering on the Employee Satisfaction-Customer Satisfaction Relationship". *Emerald Group Publishing Limited*, Vol. No.17 Pp 358-362.
- Mutsotso, W.M (2010). Merit Pay, Performance Appraisal, and Individual Motivation: an Analysis and Alternative. *Human Resource Management*, 37:131-146.
- Mwita, F. (2010). *Principles of Human Resource Management*. Perseus Publishing.
- Mukandala, T.R (2012). Incentives for Managers and Inequality among Workers: Evidence From a Firm Level Experiment. *Quarterly Journal of Economics* 122, 729-773.
- Paauwe, J., Boselie, P., & Hartog, D. (2004). Performance Management: A Model and Research Agenda, *International Association for Applied Psychology*, 54 (4) Pp.556-569.
- Prasetya, S & Kato, E.E. (2011). *Organization Theory: Modern, Symbolic, and Postmodern Perspective*. Oxford University Press, Oxford.
- Shauri (2001). *Human Resource Management* (6th ed.). New York: John Wiley and Sons, Inc.
- Shikdar, J (2012). *Organizational Learning and the Earning Organization*, Sage, London.
- Stone, K.K (2012). The Economics and Econometrics of Active Labour Market Programs. In Ashenfelter, O. & Card, D. *Handbook of Labour Economics*. Vol; 3 Pp.1865–2097.
- Suhartini (2015). The Economics and Econometrics of Active Labor Market Programs. In Ashenfelter, O. & Card, D. *Handbook of Labor Economics*. Vol; 3 Pp.1865–2097.
- Sutrisno, (2010). Psychological Contract and Employee Relationship; The Icfai University *Journal of Organization and Behavior* Vol. 7 No. 4.
- Tellis, L. (2013). HRM Practices, Organizational Citizenship Behavior, and Performance: A Multilevel Analysis, *Journal of management Studies* 47:7, Blackwell Publishing Ltd.
- Violeth, Y. (2015). *Performance in Organizations: Determinants and Appraisal*. Glenview: Scott Foreman and Company.
- Voon, et al (2011). An Introduction to Performance and Skill-Based Pay Systems, International Labor Organization, Geneva, Switzerland.
- Yin, K. (2014). Performance Appraisal's Relation with Productivity and Job Satisfaction, *Journal of Managerial Sciences* Vol. 1 No. 2.